



## Competitiveness Development of Tourism Human Resources Facing the ASEAN Economic Community in 2015: A Case Study on Hotel Human Resources in Jakarta and Bali

Nila Krisnawati, Rudy Tobing, Rachman Sjarief

Department of Management, Swiss German University, Banten, Indonesia

### Abstract

The assessment from the world economic forum in the travel and tourism competitiveness index report in 2013, put the competitiveness of Indonesian tourism in the world ranking of 70 out of 140 countries and the ranking of 3 for human resources (HRs). There are many factors that influencing competitiveness of HRs. Chan and Katau (2007) claimed that hotel performance has positive relationship with HR system, however, it did not explore the HR competitiveness yet. While Wang (2013) stated some factors related to technological at small medium enterprises are living condition analysis and evaluation indexes. Those findings did not represent specifically on the HR competitiveness at hotel industry. It is necessary to conduct a study to perform the HR competitiveness model as valuable benefit for the hotel. The research method used descriptive qualitative. The in-depth interview and focus group discussion have been delivered from 43 stars management hotel representatives in Jakarta and Bali. The result shown that beside core competency, there are other influencing factors including emotional quotient, local wisdom, and capabilities to HR competitiveness model for hotel industry. This study brings a significant contribution to the development of HR at hotels for rank-file and top management level. Further, the result improved current HR program to enhance hotel business strategy. This is one of the few research studies crafting the model of HRs competitiveness in hotel industry by taking only stars hotel in two big cities in Indonesia.

**Keywords:** Competitiveness; Human Resources; Hotel; ASEAN Economic Community

### 1. Introduction

The development of tourism sector is facing fundamental problems, such as the limited human resources (HRs) managers, both in terms of quantity and quality. Referring to the study of the World economic forum (WEF) in a report the travel and tourism competitiveness index in 2013, the competitiveness of Indonesian tourism is in the world ranking of 70 out of 140 countries. Meanwhile, the competitiveness of HRs, nature, and culture according to the WEF Indonesia is ranked 31, while Singapore and Malaysia, respectively, ranked 25 and 17. Especially for HRs, Indonesia is still ranked 61, with a score of 4.9. Ioncica et al. (2008) stated that there are several factors that affect the competitiveness of the tourism sector, among others, include the ability to interact, learning organization, HRs, and information technology.

HRs is one of the important factors as disclosed by Werner et al. (2012) that HRs professionals will implement business processes change and learning as well as consulting with other fellow HRs, to jointly build and create a value for the company. Saleem and Perweez (2012) also delivered the statement that the HRs function is very important in facilitating the employees at the hotel especially in policy establishment, the process of recruitment, selection, and development of human resource

planning in the company. Those exposures can be concluded that the HRs in the hospitality subsector plays an important role in the organization are included in other strategic issues are integrated in various field of HRs policies and practices. It also plays an important role in the communication process of companies that involve the participation of all employees including various employee retention programs for the cooperation.

The condition in which it was discovered to the lack of competitiveness can be seen from the number of workers who have been certified in term on the competence. The quality of services provided by the workforce in the world of hotel through a certification program becomes an important part in human resource development of tourism in the country. Based on data from the Ministry of Tourism, the number of certified tourism workforce reached 121,520 people out of a total of 375,000 people. This number is still too small compared to other ASEAN countries. To be ready to compete, it takes at least 50% of the workforce has obtained certification. (Bisnis.com, 2014). The Ministry of Tourism has targeted around 250,000 HRs in tourism is already certified until 2019, including HRs in hotel industry (Kompas, March 2015). Beside certification, the lack competitiveness of the tourism HRs in hotel industry was suspected considered from the absence of technical and specific problem mapping in this field.

There are many factors that influencing competitiveness of HRs. Chan and Katau (2007) claimed that hotel performance has positive relationship with HR system, however, it did not explore the HR competitiveness yet. While Wang (2013) stated some factors related to technological at small medium enterprises are living condition analysis and evaluation indexes. Those findings did not represent specifically on the HR competitiveness at hotel industry. It is necessary to conduct a study to perform the HR competitiveness model as valuable benefit for the hotel.

This article contributes to the hotel strategic management literature by enlarging the limited empirical research about HRs competitiveness topics. The empirical studies about this subject focused in Asian countries remain scarce. The results of empirical work integrating two sessions of focus group discussion (FGD) with HR leaders of stars hotel, hospitality higher education, government and certification institution. There were also in-depth interviews carried out both in Jakarta and Bali.

This paper is managed as follows: First, a literature review and supporting data are presented regarding HR competitiveness in the hotel industry followed by significant research gaps as critical evidence. Second, the research methodology is designated. We also explained results of our study. The last part is a discussion and conclusion part. In this part, we include some of the implications in terms of HR competitiveness in the hotel; the limitations of the study are also defined and continue with the future research suggestion.

## 2. Research Context: Stars Hotel in Jakarta and Bali

The Ministry of Tourism of Indonesia continues to enhance the quality of HRs facing global developments of world tourism. HRs become significant investment that can lead to business sustainability and success, since the skilled employees are the most precious resource that a service sector firm has including in hotel sector. Currently, there are about 35.000 skilled labors from different profession in tourism sector preparing themselves for their national certification of competence. Jakarta and Bali are the leading regions producing skilled labor to serve the guests both local and overseas. Bali has 11.150 skilled labors and Jakarta has 15.650 skilled labors. The Ministry of Tourism encourages particular professionals to be certified in cooperation with the professional certification body. Those professionals are hotel and restaurant, spa, hospitality, tour leader, ecotourism guide, mice, rafting guides, diving guides, museum guides, and out bond guides.

In term of destination, The Ministry of Tourism has established the destination into two classifications; main and priority of destination. Bali and Jakarta are becoming the main destination classification to achieve the tourist target of 20 million at the year of 2020. If we compare the total tourist visited Indonesia at the latest 3 years from 2013, it shown an increasing number.

Table 1 shows that the increasing number of tourist from 2013 to 2014 was 3.47%, while from 2014 to 2015 was not as higher as before (1.53%). It is highly expected that the total increasing number going to be better for 2016.

**Table 1: Total international tourist visit to Indonesia**

Tourist arrivals 2013	Tourist arrivals 2014	Tourist arrivals 2015	Tourist arrivals 2016
8,802,129	9,435,411	9,729,350	Still on-going/As per January 740,570

Source: Centre of Statistic Bureau, 2016

**Table 2: Potential gate (airport) of International Tourist to Indonesia**

No.	Location (airport)	2013	2014	2015
1.	Ngurah Rai Airport (Bali)	3,241,889	3,731,735	3,923,970
2.	Soekarno-Hatta airport (Jakarta)	2,240,502	2,246,437	2,304,275
3.	Batam	1,336,340	1,454,110	1,545,818

Source: Centre of Statistic Bureau, 2016

Jakarta and Bali are also two most productive regions as potential gate for the tourists visit Indonesia, beside Batam.

Table 2 explained us that the number of tourists visited Indonesia was potentially coming from those three locations from 2013 until 2015. It brings the consequence of the requirement of the manpower to deliver qualified service based on their expectation. The organization must apply an effective concept and model to improve their quality products since it will contribute significantly to their business performance and sustainability (Cuc, 2009). This statement will be highly correlated with the effort of this study to perform the effective model of HR competitiveness to maintain the hotel performance in Jakarat and Bali.

### 3. Literature Review

#### 3.1. The role of HRs in tourism

The existence of HRs plays an important role in tourism development. The existence of skilled labor with passion becomes an absolute necessity to compete in the global market. The quality of service becomes an important part that must be considered by the each individual including the hospitality workforce. In the tourism industry, the quality of service is a key indicator that shows the level of his all-professional. (Nandi, 2008). Based on the reference of National Constitution No. 10 of 2009 on tourism, the notion of HRs can be associated with tourism is “a wide range of tourist activities and supported a variety of facilities and services provided by communities, businesses, governments, and local governments.” The definition of tourism is all activities related to tourism and is multi-dimensional and multi-disciplinary emerging as a manifestation of the needs of each person and the country as well as the interaction between tourists and the local community, fellow travelers, government, local government, and employers. According to the Constitution, the definition of tourism industry is “a collection of integrated tourism businesses to produce goods and or services to meet the needs of travelers in tourism operation.” Based on the terms of tourism above, the HRs in tourism is the whole human aspect that supports tourism activities is both tangible and intangible that aims to meet the needs and realize the creation of tourist satisfaction and positive impact on the economy, welfare, and environmental sustainability and cultural a tourist area.

According Nawawi (2001) there are three terms of HRs, namely: (a) HRs are the people who work in the environment of an organization (also called the personnel, labor, worker or employee),

(b) HR is the human potential as a driving force in realizing the organization's existence,

(c) HRs are a potential that the assets and serves as the capital (nonmaterial/nonfinancial) in business organizations, which can manifest into real potential (real) physical and nonphysical in realizing the existence of the organization.

Tourism industry relies highly on human existence. The human aspect is one of which acts as a driving force for the survival of the tourism industry in a country. There was a significant relationship between HRs practices with efforts to achieve a high quality of service in hotel operations. It becomes a

strong indicator that the practice of HRs is an important parameter influencing the attitude of the staff/employees of the hotel to guests (Tsaura and Lin, 2004).

Human resource is one factor that plays an important role in promoting the tourism sector. The importance of HRs in the tourism sector is a very important resource in most organizations. Especially in service-based organizations, HR role as a key factor in achieving successful performance (Evans et al., 2003). Improving the quality of HRs becomes one of the keys to winning the global competition is increasingly competitive. Prerequisite for it is tourism education and training system that supports the preparation and implementation of tourism labor competency standards (Priowirjanto, 2001).

Managing HR tourism also means empowering the HRs as optimally as possible to achieve best performance in service organizations including the hotel. HRs effectively requires motivation, empowerment, and teamwork within the working environment (Meliou and Maroudas, 2011). That role, among others, can be achieved through a few things (Ardahaey and Nabilou, 2012), namely: Preparing a standard service standard to improve satisfaction for guests, providing services as desired by tourists/guests, performs better communication among employees and between employees and management, improve job satisfaction by having an atmosphere and a dynamic work environment, increase productivity and work efficiency, utilizing creativity and innovation in carrying out the work, have squeezed "own" both the company and the teamwork, improve the quality of work, reduce their the cost is not efficient, improving their skills in decision-making and achieve short-term goals and long-term it has set to improve welfare. From the above description, it can be concluded that there are several important roles existence of HRs in the tourism industry, namely as the motor industry viability; the main actors who create the core tourism product (experience); and one of the determinants of industrial competitiveness.

So far been few studies that have been done in exploring the role of its special tourism HRs for the hospitality subsector integrated with the development of competitiveness. Besides that there is very little research to identify potential subsectors of tourism and hospitality needs of HRs needed for regional and international market characteristics.

### 3.2. The classification of HRs in tourism

The HRs involve in tourism sector could be classified into (1) Human as those who travel (tourists) and (2) human individuals or groups who act as the parties produce products and/or services to meet the needs of travelers. Based on the National Medium Term Development Plan (RPJMN) 2010-2014 field of culture, tourism, youth and sports, HR Tourism can be grouped into (a) HRs are in governance institutions that produce the policy and regulatory issues in tourism development; (b) HRs are in educational institutions but has not been directly involved in the tourism industry include: Management of educational institutions, educators, and students (student or student); (c) HRs have been directly involved in tourism business activities as a party whose role is to produce products and/or services for tourists in a business activity formal, which can be grouped into tourism businesses, including entrepreneurs who manage a wide range of types of tourism businesses, tourism industry workers who shelter under a tourism business in formal institutions sector; (d) people who are stand outside the formal institutions sector but related to the tourism business. When referring to tourism as an industry, then the human resource in tourism is the people involved to produce the needs of travelers in the tourism industry include: Tourist attraction, the area of tourism, transportation services travel, travel services, services of food and drinks, providing accommodation, organization of entertainment and leisure activities, organizing meetings, incentive travel, conferences and exhibitions (MICE), tourism information services, tourism consulting services, tour guide services, water tourism, and spa.

Meanwhile, the classification of tourism according to the version of the UNWTO, the HRs involved in the following activities: (1) Tourism services sector, which includes travel agents and airlines, (2) hospitality businesses include provision accommodation/lodging, the business of providing food and beverages (food and beverage service) and catering (catering), and the entertainment business (entertainment and leisure).

There was still limited research focusing into competitiveness on HRs in hotel sector by engaging many sectors including government, educational institutions and certification bodies, tourism entrepreneurs and tourism community.

### 3.3. Tourism HR competitiveness hospitality field

Altarawneh and Aldehayyat (2011) stated that the service industry is very significant in absorbing labor. It also takes a special skill of the workers, as well as hard work, commitment and attitude and good behavior. Therefore the role of human resource is very vital in this industry. However, the key success in the competitiveness of human resource development in the hotel field is core competencies (core competence) and capability (capability). The challenge in the development of competitiveness is how to attract recruitment of competent and had the capability to contribute to achieving the company's goals (Beardwell et al., 2004; Xiao, 2010). Effectiveness of Human Resource Management (HRM) can help businesses achieve its competitive advantage in the hospitality field (Baum, 2007). Strategic Human Resource Management has been established as a continuing effort to align the organization's personnel policies and practices with business strategy (Boxall et al. 1998). Hall et al. (2009) also stated that argues that resource management is largely about integration and adaptation.

There is still few research exploration on the competitiveness of HRs, especially hotel sector which draws on the alignment of mutual recognition (MRA) ASEAN. During this time the indicators of competitiveness in the exploration still common in the field of services and hospitality but was not associated with market needs as well as regional agreements such as the ASEAN MRA.

### 3.4. Conceptual framework

Based on detailed survey evidence in 2012, the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) countries also largely agree on the key elements to be considered in a tourism competitiveness assessment (Dupeyras et al., 2013). The OECD is a multi-disciplinary intergovernmental organization of 34 member countries which engages in its work an increasing number of nonmembers from all regions of the world. The organization's core mission today is to help governments work together toward a stronger, cleaner, fairer global economy. The OECD member countries are Australia, Austria, Belgium, Canada, Chile, the Czech Republic, Denmark, Estonia, Finland, France, Germany, Greece, Hungary, Iceland, Ireland, Israel, Italy, Japan, Korea, Luxembourg, Mexico, the Netherlands, New Zealand, Norway, Poland, Portugal, the Slovak Republic, Slovenia, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, Turkey, the United Kingdom, and the United States. The European Commission takes part in the work of the OECD.

The use of a conceptual framework that reflects the integrated nature of competitiveness in tourism while organizing the indicators in a way useful to decision-makers. One of the determinant factors is HRs development aspect with the parameter utilized are including skills, education and training, labor productivity, tourism training centers. These parameters will be a basic framework for further model development of this study.

## 4. Research Method

The research is an empirical study used descriptive qualitative. We conducted two times FGD and in-depth interview with seven HR corporate leaders in Jakarta and Bali. The participants of the FGD were from stars hotels in Jakarta and Bali which aligned with the Indonesia Hotel HRs Manager Association (Indonesia-HHRMA). Those activities were conducted between September and December 2016 to collect specific information for the development of this research. Meanwhile, the questionnaires of the FGD were explored about four topics: (1) The classification of the hotel HRs area needs to be improved its competitiveness (Example: Based on the level? Job?), (2) the understanding of "human resource competitiveness," (3) the measurement (parameters) of HR competitiveness can be used in practice, and (4) strategies can be proposed to achieve the HR competitiveness. The FGD session was organized in 3 h in length from 09.00 to 12.00 am.

The list of FGD participant is described in Tables 3 and 4.

## 5. Findings

The antecedent of the HRs competitiveness in hotel industry based on FGD in Jakarta and Bali.

First, the author set up the criteria and procedural implementation mechanism of the FGD. It was created that the atmosphere or discussion FGD process was informal so that all participants participate actively in the discussion. The number of participants in a group is around 7 until 10 people, however, it can be extended to 12 people. These numbers will make each individual delivering their opinion and thought on particular matter (Krueger, 1998).

The study pursued to identify the antecedents of HRs competitiveness in the hotel practice by combining between conceptual framework that reflects the integrated nature of competitiveness in tourism from OECD and the FGD result from Indonesia Hotel HRs Manager/Leaders. The FGD result shown as follow:

- i. Skill is one of fundamental aspect in shaping the competency in all industries including in the hotel. There are four critical skills claimed by Ineson and Kempa (1996), including oral and written communication, supervisory, ability to assure the customer satisfaction and skill for delivery qualified service. However, there are other skills based on Kay and Russette (2000) that are important in business administration such as leadership and communication.
- ii. Education and training will provide competitive advantages to an organization. It will provide people with knowledge and how fast it can learn something new. It is known that education and

**Table 3: List of FGD participants in Jakarta**

No.	Participant name code	Participant position
1	RK	Human resources director
2	YS	Human resources director
3	NS	Human resources director
4	RF	Human resources director
5	FS	Human resources director
6	TM	Certification body
7	GUM	Government
8	RLA	Tourism higher education
9	MY	Tourism higher education
10	EG	Tourism higher education

Source : Researcher, 2016, FGD: Focus group discussion

**Table 4: List of FGD participants in Bali**

No.	Participant name code	Participant position
1	VR	Human resources director
2	ETS	Human resources director
3	IGW	General manager
4	HT	Human resources manager
5	YL	Human resources director
6	KTPA	Tourism higher education
7	WH	Human resources director
8	RS	General manager
9	IKTB	Tourism higher education
10	IPD	Tourism higher education
11	RK	Human resources director

Source : Researcher, 2016, FGD: Focus group discussion



training will enrich people with necessary and relevant knowledge and skills for daily operational activities and improve business and create competitive advantages (Akhtar et al., 2008). Institute of Management Development (IMD) - Switzerland with the title; IMD World Talent Report 2015, which is about the talented and skilled labor ranked in the world in 2015. The report stated that Indonesia's ranking dropped from rank 16 to rank 25 in 2014 to rank 41 in 2015. The ranking is calculated with three parameters, namely:

- a. Factor of development and investment.
- b. Attractiveness factors of a country.
- c. Human resource readiness factors.

For HRs readiness factor, Indonesia only excel in the growth of labor force with the rank of fifth. Other indicators such as international experience, competence of senior managers, the education system, managerial education, and language skills are ranked in the top 30.

Table 6 is the opinion from participant on aspects influencing human competitiveness in hotel.

From the FGD above, it can be concluded that;

- a. Competitiveness is an advantage that is characteristic of a person to be able to grow and develop appropriate changes and environmental dynamics, which can be demonstrated through the performance and productivity of the company (hotel).
- b. As for the form factor of competitiveness for HR areas of the hotel are classified into two:
  1. Internal; education, training, certification, Emotional Intelligent, capability, productivity
  2. External; consisting of local wisdom (wisdom social) culture.

Emotional intelligent is quite interesting aspects to be studied, considering this aspect has never been associated previously in the discussion related to the competitiveness of HRs. Emotional Intelligence (Goleman, 2000), convey an understanding of the importance of emotional intelligence. There are five areas that fall into this intelligence category such as:

- Recognize emotions: Self-awareness.
- Able to manage emotions: Is the ability to describe the feelings appropriately.
- Motivate themselves is an important part of yourself to achieve goals.
- Recognizing emotions in others: Empathy, an ability that also relies on emotional self-awareness, including developing the network.
- Relationship: The art of relationships, most of the skills to manage the emotions of others.

These five areas are important areas an emotional intelligence, a factor supporting the capacity and capability of a person, including in the field of hospitality. Emotional intelligence can interpret as an individual's ability to find, manage emotions and feelings of self and others, emotional intelligence can develop skills of personal and social skills, with indicators: Knowing the emotions themselves, believe in themselves, manage emotions, boost achievement, empathy, social skills, and collaboration. However, further study is needed the extent of emotional intelligence is capable of providing a significant influence

**Table 5: FGD participants and question on "skill"**

No.	Participant name code	The importance of skill
1	RK, YS, NS, RF, FS	They agree that skill is very critical in hotel industry. However, it is also necessary to classify the skill and other competency based on the job level of the employee. It is suspected that the rank and file level of Indonesia's hotel employee are considered less competitive due to the language and education
2	TM, GUM, RLA	The data in the certification institution shown that most certified holder are at the clerical level. Therefore, it is also necessary to cluster the skill for the each level (low, middle and top)
3	MY, EG	It is necessary for education to design curriculum based on the standard competency

FGD: Focus group discussion, Source: Researcher, 2016

**Table 6: FGD participants and question on “competitiveness”**

Participant name code	Competitiveness
FR, RK, VR, GUM, IKTB	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The main aspect in competitiveness is competence</li> <li>• When a person has a particular advantage to be able to provide excellent service to guests</li> <li>• Culture is an important aspect, especially for the area just as Bali</li> <li>• “Local Wisdom” to consider the diversity of Indonesian culture</li> </ul>
EG, TM, LA, IPD	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ability to compete with workers from ASEAN</li> <li>• The level of productivity result from the working process</li> <li>• Education and training becomes one of the aspects that must be measured</li> <li>• Culture is important because it emphasizes the unique and distinguishing features of the Indonesian nation in service</li> <li>• Skill and competency especially the language is absolutely necessary in HR competitiveness</li> </ul>
IQ IGW, RS, NS	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It is an ability to be able to compete and adapt to global demand</li> <li>• Competitiveness is critical to moving forward</li> <li>• Cultural factors should be a concern</li> <li>• Emotional Intelligent also worth considering, especially for those who are at the managerial level</li> <li>• Capabilities and competence are the main factor of competitiveness</li> </ul>
HT, WH, EG	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ability to grow and develop</li> <li>• Related to the performance and productivity</li> <li>• Education and training is important factor to be improved</li> </ul>
TM, LA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• If someone is able to demonstrate the unique advantages and produce for themselves, the company and the environment</li> <li>• Having a recognized certification globally become one of the important indicators</li> <li>• Aspects of cultural diversity are hallmarks Indonesia</li> </ul>

FGD: Focus group discussion

on competitiveness. The other interesting point is the local wisdom. Local knowledge (local wisdom) is defined as the knowledge on the balance of the relationship between oneself with the surrounding nature that looks at the behavior of people in an area, and it is associated with the culture and customs that have been given from generation to generation in a region. This wisdom can be abstract and also that can be applied in everyday life. Behavior that is in place that reflects the mix of elements of nature, self and also the relationship with his creator; that places emphasis on the respect our elders and that has a higher experience. It is a portrait of the sublime values that exceed the value of materialism (Nakorntap et al., 1996). Local knowledge is now often also associate the concept of “creative Tourism,” a concept introduced by Raymond and Richards in 2000. This is based on personal experiences while traveling to Thailand, Indonesia, and Australia. “Creative Tourism” is defined as a way of giving an opportunity for tourists to develop creative abilities by engaging in courses and learning in the places he visited (Richard and Raymond, 2000. p. 18). Seree and Nantasuwana (2002. p.15) stated the guideline to explore the local wisdom into 4 (four) categories:

1. Conservation: To preserve the culture and customs that exists in the area to continue to be used.
2. Restoration: Fixing what has been lost from the culture and customs of the area to be in use back in.
3. Adaptation: Align customs/habits of the old with the current conditions without losing the essence of the old customs.
4. Updates: Create new things based on experience on the culture and customs in previous days.

Next questions were about the strength and weakness of current hotel HR in Indonesia. The strength is nature-friendly, sincere, always helping others is characteristic that should be featured.



The weakness of HRs related to the field of hotel are some aspects include; shyness, low self-esteem, are less able to adapt, tend to be low profile, less experienced, education is low, stuttering technology.

The following questions are the strategy to increase the hotel HR competitiveness is following:

1. Redesign the training and development programs, which led to the development of measurement characteristics of a job (job characteristic) is given. Does someone in a department (front office) will be able to contribute better when compared with if the person concerned was in the back office.
2. Improving career development program. Through career development, the use of HRs would be optimal that impact on employee performance improvement for the company.
3. Certification of competence, the duty set out in government regulations, among others Decree from the Labor Ministry No. PER. 21/MEN/X/2007 on Procedures for the Establishment of the National Competence Indonesia and Government Regulation No. 52 of 2012 on certification of competency and certification of business in Tourism. Various schemes can be adjusted to suit the certification participants include; occupational schemes for industry, cluster schemes for vocational and qualification scheme for students/alumni.
4. Provides the opportunity to pursue the staff taking higher education, particularly for those who would occupy strategic positions, such as director or general manager level.
5. Collaboration with stakeholders such as higher education institutions, government and related professional associations such as HHRMA. Collaboration may be designing a curriculum that is based on the link and match as well as organizing various events such as the competition on competency skills in the areas of the hotel (Table 5).

Based on the exposure in the FGD related redesign (redesign) of a job, then it will be associated with one's internal work. The internal aspect of this work consists of a variety of skills, clarity of duties, the interest rate of duty, freedom, and responsibility as well as feedback from the task to be done by the employee (Berry, 1998). These aspects will affect the quality of work produced by a person, which in turn is related to productivity and competitiveness. This approach also has been used by Hackman and Oldman (1980), who argued that job characteristic model is predictive of an individual on the tasks that correspond with his work, which includes skill variety, task identity, task significance, autonomy, and feedback. Griffin (2002), states that the diverse range of skills that employees, the degree of flatness of the work is reduced, which in turn will affect the person's creativity and competitiveness.

Figure 1 shows the model development of competitiveness of HR in hotel based on the FGD result.

Related to career development, as expressed in the FGD, verily career development becomes an important part in increasing the motivation of employees in the achievement in a variety of positions, fields and different jobs. Some of the activities undertaken may include coaching, job rotation, education, and training, (Kaswan, 2011).

### 5.1. Practitioner implication and Hotel HR Competitiveness Development Model

Aspects of competitiveness become critical for these aspects to be one of the key indicators in the context of global competition as well as a leverage factor for the performance of the economy, including in the era of the ASEAN Economic Community. Model development of competitiveness of HR in hotel is expected to accelerate the competitive strategy to be the ultimate. Based on the results of the FGD, aspects that are considered able to be forming HRs competitiveness for hotel include;

1. Aspects of competence.
2. Aspect education level.
3. Aspects of local wisdom.
4. Aspects of emotional intelligence.

This study brings significant contribution to the development of HR at hotels for rank-file and top management level. Further, the result improved current HR program to enhance hotel business strategy.

**Figure 1:** Hotel human resources competitiveness development model

Source: Researcher, 2016

## 6. Conclusion and Recommendation

- a. The position is at the level of rank and file and the top level.
- b. Potential HR hospitality field should be a concern for all parties, both education sectors, professional associations, industry including the government.
- c. The need mapped based on the level of office:
  - Craft level: Attitude (attitude) and language is an important aspect considered
  - Managerial level: The responsibility is higher than required the skills in decision-making, develop networking, including leadership.
- d. The competitiveness is the characteristic of a person to be able to grow and develop appropriate changes and environmental dynamics, which can be demonstrated through the performance and productivity of the company (hotel).
- e. The strength of hotel HR in Indonesia are nature-friendly, sincere, always helping others. As for the weaknesses among others, include shyness, low self-esteem, are less able to adapt, tend to be low profile, less experienced, education is low, stuttering technology.
- f. Strategic Human Resource Development in Hospitality may include: The redesign training programs and development, career development programs better, program competency certification, rising education levels, as well as collaboration with stakeholders such as higher education institutions, government and relevant professional associations such as HHRMA.

## 7. Recommendation

- a. The design of development programs need to be more specific by setting the parameters that can be measured.
- b. Conduct further research by examining the model with the statistical approach (quantitative) and involving the respondents of various hotel stakeholders.

## References

- Akhtar, S., Ding, D.Z., Ge, L.G. (2008), Strategic HRM practices and their impact on company performance in Chinese enterprises. *Human Resource Management*, 47(1), 15-32.
- Altarawneh, I.I., Aldehayyat, J.S. (2011), Strategic human resources management (SHRM) in Jordanian hotels. *International Journal of Business and Management*, 6(10), 245-255.
- Ardahaey, F.T., Nabilou, H. (2012), Human resources empowerment and its role in the sustainable tourism. *Asian Social Science*, 8(1), 33-38.
- Available from: <http://www.industri.bisnis.com/read/20141204/12/379808/mea-2015-kemenpar-pacu-sertifikasi-tenaga-pariwisata>. [diakses pada 2015 Apr 10].
- Available from: <http://www.travel.kompas.com/read/2015/01/31/092800827/Target.Kemenpar.250.000.SDM.Pariwisata.Tersertifikasi>. [diakses pada 2015 Apr 02].
- Available from: <http://www.travel.kompas.com/read/2015/03/24/094553127/Gubernur.Bali.Dukung.Program.Sertifikasi.Pelaku.Pariwisata>. [diakses pada 2015 Mar 27].
- Baum, T. (2007), Human resources in tourism: Still waiting for change. *Tourism Management*, 28, 1383-1399.
- Beardwell, I., Holden, L., Claydo, T. (2004), *Human Resource Management Contemporary Approach*. 4<sup>th</sup> ed. England: Pearson Education Limited.
- Berry, L.M. (1998), *Psychology At Work: An Introduction to Industrial and Organizational Psychology*. Singapore: McGraw Hill.
- Boxall, P. (1998), Achieving competitive advantage through human resource strategy: Towards a theory of industry dynamics. *Human Resource Management Review*, 8(3), 265-288.
- Chand, M., Katou, A.A. (2007), The impact of HRM practices on organizational performance in the Indian hotel industry. *Employee Relations*, 29(6), 576-594.
- Cuc, S. (2009), Sustainable development - A major desideratum for the producers of textiles machines. *Industria Textila*, 60(3), 169-174.
- Dupeyras, A., MacCallum, N. (2013), Indicators for Measuring Competitiveness in Tourism: A Guidance Document. OECD Tourism Papers, 2013/02, OECD Publishing. Available from: <http://www.dx.doi.org/10.1787/5k479q2t923-en>. [Last accessed on 2016 Nov 11].
- Evans, N., Campbell, D., Stonehouse, G. (2003), *Strategic Management for Travel and Tourism*. Amsterdam: Butterworth-Heinemann.
- Goleman, D. (2002), *Working With Emotional Intelligence (Terjemahan)*. Jakarta: PT. Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Griffin, J. (2002), *Dialih bahasakan oleh Dwi Kartini Yahya. Customer Loyalty How to Earn It, How to Keep It*. Singapore: Lexington Books.
- Hall, M., Hall, C., Andrade, L., Drake, B. (2009), Strategic human resource management: The evolution of the field. *Human Resource Management Review*, 19, 64-85.
- Hackman, J.R., Oldham, G.R. (1980), *Work Redesign*. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company.
- Ineson, E.M., Kempa, R.F. (1996), Selection for vocational courses at university: Part I - Perspectives of the employers of graduates. *Education and Training*, 38(6), 14-19.
- Ioncica, M., Tala, M., Brindusoiu, C., Ioncica, D. (2008), The factors of competitiveness in the hospitality industry and the competitive strategy of firms. *Annals of the University of Oradea, Economic Science Series*, 17(2), 213-218.
- Kaswan. (2011), *Pelatihan dan Pengembangan Untuk Meningkatkan Kinerja SDM*. Bandung: Penerbit Alfabeta.
- Kay, C., Russette, J. (2000), Hospitality management competencies. *Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly*, 41(1), 52-63.
- Krueger, R.A. (1998), *Analyzing and Reporting Focus Group Results*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Meliou, E., Maroudas, L. (2011), Career development in the hospitality industry in Greece: Implications for human resource practices. *Journal of Human Resources in Hospitality and Tourism*, 10, 218-233.
- Nandi. (2008), *Pariwisata dan pengembangan sumberdaya manusia*. Jurnal GEA Jurusan Pendidikan Geografi, 8(1), April 2008.
- Nawawi, H.H. (2001), *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia Untuk Bisnis Kompetitif*. Yogyakarta: UGM Press.
- Priowirjanto, G.H. (2001), Bureaucracy and the Indonesia Tourism Policy Facing AFTA 2003. Papers in a Seminar Organized by the Tourism Yogyakarta Tourism Training Center in Yogyakarta, July 21; 2001.
- Saleem, S.M., Perwez, S.K. (2012), The human resources role and challenges in the hotel sector in Kanyakumari, Tamil Nadu. *International Journal of Management Research and Review*, 2(10), 1758-1763.
- Seree, P., Nantasuan, V. (2002). *Community Model Scheme, People Research and Development*. Ban Klang: Phthumtani University.

- Tsaura, S., Lin, Y. (2004), Promoting service quality in tourist hotels: The role of HRM practices and service behaviour. *Tourism Management*, 25, 471-481.
- Undang-undang Nomor 10 Tahun. (2009), Tentang Kepariwisata Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Nasional (RPJMN) 2010-2014 bidang kebudayaan, pariwisata, pemuda dan olahraga.
- Wang, W.L. (2013), Evaluation of ecological competitiveness of coal enterprises and empirical research, China university of geosciences. *Ecology, Environment and Conservation Journal*, 10, 248.
- Werner, S., Schuler, R.S., Jackson, S.E. (2012), *Human Resources Management*. 11<sup>th</sup> ed. Mason, OH: South-Western Cengage Learning.
- Wright, P.M., McMahan, G.C. (1992), Theoretical perspectives for strategic human resource management. *Journal of Management*, 18(2), 295-320.
- Xiao, Y. (2010), *The Importance of Staff Training in Hotel Industry: Case Study: Renaissance Shanghai Yuyuan Hotel*. Unpublished PhD Thesis, Vaasan University of Applied Sciences.